

COUNTY COUNCIL

WEDNESDAY, 13 DECEMBER 2017

PRESENT: Councillor H.I. Jones (Chair)

Councillors:

F. Akhtar	S.M. Allen	K.V. Broom	C.A. Campbell
J.M. Charles	D.M. Cundy	S.A. Curry	A. Davies
C.A. Davies	T.A.J. Davies	G. Davies	H.L. Davies
I.W. Davies	J.A. Davies	S.L. Davies	W.R.A. Davies
E. Dole	J.S. Edmunds	P.M. Edwards	D.C. Evans
H.A.L. Evans	L.D. Evans	W.T. Evans	A.L. Fox
S.J.G. Gilasbey	C.J. Harris	P. Hughes-Griffiths	T.M. Higgins
J.K. Howell	P.M. Hughes	A. James	J.D. James
R. James	D.M. Jenkins	J.P. Jenkins	G.H. John
C. Jones	B.W. Jones	D. Jones	A. Lenny
M.J.A. Lewis	K. Lloyd	K. Madge	S. Matthews
A.S.J. McPherson	E. Morgan	A.G. Morgan	S. Najmi
D. Nicholas	B.D.J. Phillips	J.S. Phillips	D. Price
J.G. Prosser	B.A.L. Roberts	E.M.J.G. Schiavone	H.B. Shepardson
L.M. Stephens	B. Thomas	D. Thomas	E.G. Thomas
G.B. Thomas	G. Thomas	J. Tremlett	A.Vaughan Owen
D.T. Williams	D.E. Williams	J.E. Williams	

Also Present:

M. James, Chief Executive
C. Moore, Director of Corporate Services
R. Mullen, Director of Environment
G. Morgans, Director of Education & Children's Services
G. Morgan, Head of Democratic Services
D. Hockenhull, Marketing and Media Manager
J. Morgan, Director of Community Services
L.R. Jones, Head of Administration and Law
W. Walters, Director of Regeneration & Policy
P.R. Thomas, Assistant Chief Executive (People Management & Performance)
P.R. Thomas, Assistant Chief Executive (People Management & Performance)
L.R. Jones, Head of Administration and Law
D. Hockenhull, Marketing and Media Manager
G. Morgan, Democratic Services Manager

Chamber, County Hall, Carmarthen - 10.00 am - 12.30 pm

1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors L.R. Bowen, R.E. Evans, D. Harries, T.J. Jones, A.D.T. Speake, G.B. Thomas and J.E. Williams.

2. DECLARATIONS OF PERSONAL INTERESTS.

There were no declarations of personal interest made at the meeting.

3. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS.

Congratulations was extended to:-

- staff of the Rural Conservation Section of the Environment Department who had recent received a Highly Commended award from the Wales Planning awards for Caeau Mynydd Mawr Special Area of Conservation-Supplementary Planning Guidance and Marsh Fritillary Project
- Johnny Clayton an employee of the Authority who had reached the final of the UK Darts Championship and was currently ranked as one of the top 25 darts players in the world.
- Congratulations was extended Niall Maxwell from Llangeler who had recently won the Royal Institute of British Architects House of the Year 2017 Award and it was suggested that a letter of congratulations be sent on behalf of the Authority.
- Cennydd and Dafydd Hywel who recently represented Wales and won the Pairs Short Mat Bowls British Championships and also to Gethin and Aled Edwards who along with Cennydd and Dafydd won the Taylors World Bowls 4's Championship.

Appreciation was extended to:-

- the emergency services and staff of the Council during the recent fire at Gransby Close Llanelli. Thanks was also extended to the Head of Housing, together with the Executive Board Member for Housing and the Authority's housing emergency response team who had assisted on the night and provided the residents with alternative accommodation.
- staff within the Highways Division who had worked throughout the night to ensure that the Authority's roads were gritted during the recent period of adverse weather.

Best wishes was extended to :-

- Councillor Eirwyn Williams who was currently convalescing at home following recent surgery.
- Cor Ieuenctid Sir Gar and the Carmarthenshire Brass Ensemble who would be participating in the Welsh Assembly Carol Service in Cardiff later that evening.

4. TO APPROVE AND SIGN AS A CORRECT RECORD THE MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL MEETING HELD ON THE 15TH NOVEMBER, 2017.

RESOLVED that the minutes of the Council meeting held on the 15th November 2017 be approved and signed as a correct record subject to the name of Councillor Deryk Cundy being removed from the list of members in attendance.

5. INSIGHT PRESENTATION.

The Council was informed that a number of pupils from Carmarthenshire Schools recently participated at an event at Theatr y Ffwrnes in Llanelli, organised by the Council. The annual event provided the pupils with an insight into the difficult decisions facing a local authority in terms of the budget setting process and allowed them to look at various budget proposals and bring forward recommendations in the role of the Executive Board.

In order for Council to see a flavor of the presentations and contributions made, the Council received presentations from pupils representing the following schools:-

Dyffryn Aman
Bro Dinefwr
Bro Myrddin
Glanymor
Maes y Gwendraeth
Queen Elizabeth High School

The Leader introduced the pupils from each school and, following their presentations, thanked them for attending.

6. VIDEO PRESENTATION - YOUNG ADULT CARERS.

The Council received a short video which provided a background to a petition lodged by a young Carmarthenshire carer.

Each and every member was encourage to sign up to the Young Carers Petition which aimed to change the law to allow carers to study more than 21 hours a week and claim Carers Allowance.

7. PUBLIC QUESTIONS (NONE RECEIVED).

No public questions were received.

8. QUESTIONS BY MEMBERS:-

8.1. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ANDREW JAMES TO COUNCILLOR GLYNOG DAVIES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN

“Welsh Government have proposed that by 2050, it would expect 1 million residents in Wales to be able to speak Welsh. This is an ambitious target, nevertheless a challenge to us all. We in Carmarthenshire can and will contribute substantially to this target, only if the correct provisions and education support are

in place. Ysgol Bro Dinefwr in Llandeilo is a 2b category bilingual school. Pupils can receive their education in Welsh, English or a combination of both languages. This means extra teaching staff available to teach at all year levels in order to meet the requirements of the demand of education through the medium of Welsh. It is at these Welsh Medium Schools that the Welsh Language target of 1 million people speaking the language will be met. In order to do that, the schools need a complete review of its school funding formula. If Welsh Government wants the people to speak our language, then please let's put in place the proper provision with adequate funding to deliver services. If funding is not properly provided 2b schools such as Ysgol Bro Dinefwr will not be obliged to offer the full Welsh Education it currently provides. Can we as an authority please write to Kirsty Williams AM for Education at Cardiff to look at the situation and review the financial formula within our schools?"

Response by Councillor Glynog Davies Executive Board Member for Education & Children:-

Yes I am fully aware of the Cymraeg 2050 target, and this has been factored into our Welsh in Education Strategic Plan. Now then a 1million welsh speakers, very ambitious target, but we want to try and assist in reaching that goal and it requires the education system locally and indeed throughout the whole of Wales to play a prominent role in respect of this target. Yes, our Welsh in Education Strategic Plan states that all, yes Councillors, all of our schools here in Carmarthenshire need to move along with the language continuum, in some way or another. We therefore expect our English medium schools, bilingual, Welsh medium schools to engage pro-actively in this agenda.

Now one of the first meetings I had after my appointment to this post was a visit to Ysgol Bro Dinefwr in Llandeilo to meet the Head, Chair of Governors, and Councillor Andrew James, and I was told quite clearly that the school was facing very serious financial challenges and were making it difficult to make ends meet. I explained that a review of 2B schools, in other words the category in which Bro Dinefwr has been placed in is happening, in other words these are the dual stream schools where both Welsh and English education is provided. 80% of the subject, apart from Welsh as a subject and English as a subject are provided through the medium of Welsh but the subjects are also taught through the medium of English where there is demand.

Now following my visit to and a subsequent meeting with the Director, we have completed the review I mentioned, a review of 2B schools. We looked at the funding model and also a curriculum analysis for this particular school. On Monday of this week my officers had a very very constructive meeting with the Headteacher and also the Chair of Governors and at that meeting the draft report of the findings and our recommendations were shared and discussed. There are proposals, Councillors for increasing the bilingual supplement for schools such as Bro Dinefwr and how the 2B model should evolve in Bro Dinefwr in order to be a full 2B school. Of course, any changes made to the funding formula has to be discussed with all secondary school headteachers because any increase in the bilingual settlement will need to be found from the secondary school budget allocation and there is no increase in that pot. I am aware that a meeting has been convened for Friday, 12th January and this matter will be on the agenda. Now, at a recent WLGA meeting with the Cabinet Secretary for Education, I did

challenge her on the allocation of funding for education. Although there are references to protect education and additional funding they are only references, this isn't, and I have to stress this, this isn't as it seems. Money has been taken from a series of grants and put into the RSG, that is the Revenue Support Grant. But remember, overall, we have had a reduction of .5%. Kirsty Williams' answer was that she had brokered the best possible deal but there was no extra money for education. I am pleased to inform you this morning that we were successful in our bid for funding to pilot the School Business Manager approach in Carmarthenshire, and Mr Meirwyn Thomas, a senior auditor from our Resources section has been seconded into that role and will work in particular with Ysgol Bro Dinefwr and its cluster to ensure value for money and realise efficiencies. I am confident that this approach will benefit the school.

Just a word in conclusion, those of you who are Governors of 2B schools need to remember this. This is not two schools under one roof with different staff, that is not what a category 2B school is about, it is one school with dual streams, and so it means that you as Governors have to look radically at your administration. In the question you talk about full review of the funding formula, now that is happening. May I add also that Governors also have a responsibility to consider internally your own staffing formula and employ as many bilingual staff where possible. There is no need therefore to double additional costs. I hope that that answers the question.

8.2. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR DERYK CUNDY TO COUNCILLORS GLYNOG DAVIES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN AND COUNCILLOR HAZEL EVANS, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR ENVIRONMENT

“Despite the considerable efforts of the Highway Departments, Education Officials, Teachers, Head Teachers, PCSOs and County Councillors from all parties to ensure the safety of our school children to access and egress our schools, especially those for under 11 years old, this is being undermined by inconsiderate actions by some of the guardians of the children themselves. Typically, this is caused by people dangerously parking, opposite school gates, double parking, parking on corners, parking on pavements, parking so that an ambulance or fire engine cannot get past but more importantly creating a frighteningly dangerous environment for children crossing the road. The people causing this mayhem do not seem to realise or to take responsibility during this frenzied period for creating this dangerous situation and I believe that it is only a matter of time before a child is injured, maimed or even killed. What do you feel can be done to make this a safer environment for our children and to impress upon the public the need for greater care for all our children when picking up and dropping off their charges at school?”

Response by Councillors Hazel Evans, Executive Board Member for Environment:-

Thank you very much Cllr Cundy for your question on a matter which is of concern and a matter which can take place at a lot of other schools throughout the County at pick up and drop off times. It is always useful to refer to the highway-code when dealing with matters on the highway, it is perhaps interesting to note that rule 243 of the code states:-

Do not stop or park near a school entrance; anywhere you would prevent access for Emergency Services except when forced to do so by stationary traffic.

The Council through the Education and highway department has continued to work with partners on a range of interventions that include, Investment in safe routes with the support of the Welsh Government Funding; Development of Active Travel infrastructure; speeding enforcement around school sites; education to encourage more sustainable and healthier forms of travel to school, such as walking and cycling. Our walking bus initiative is well supported by schools, children and parents and parking enforcement. With regard to parking enforcement, members will be aware that last month we approved a recommendation that the Council applies for additional powers from the Welsh Government to use technology for enforcement on a number of sites. These sites include schools. The powers will enable the Authority to use mobile enforcement cameras to use penalty charge notices, where people who park and then contravene any traffic regulation order in place. This will assist, but ultimately the parents, carers and guardians of children who can provide the solution to this by encouraging travel by other methods, such as walking and cycling. Or where there is a need to travel by car to park further away from the school sites.

Many of us sit on governing bodies, and I would urge all to encourage schools to write to parents, guardians, carers to remind them of the need to respond positively to this matter, by changing behaviour and travel mode for the journey to school. This is about changing people's behaviours, and what is very clear is that the Council cannot do this on its own or solely through enforcement. The issue can only be tackled with the help and involvement of schools and the support of residents and most crucially motorists.

Lastly, the Police are now willing to accept video dash-camera evidence of traffic offences, so if anybody has those I would encourage you to send them into the Police. Thank you

Response by Councillor Glynog Davies, Executive Board Member for Education & Children:-

Thank you Chair, yes it was a question to both of us, and may I thank my fellow member on the Executive Board for giving a full and comprehensive answer with regard to the situation. The content of the question is one that concerns us all and I am grateful to you for the question and it's an issue that needs to be highlighted. It is of concern because it is a very serious problem.

You asked the question, Councillor Cundy, what do you feel can be done. Perhaps it should read what do you feel 'should' be done, and Hazel has given a comprehensive response and answer. Those causing the danger, I have to say, are inconsiderate, very, very inconsiderate. Our message seems to be falling on deaf ears. But we must continue to communicate with parents/guardians about the importance of safety. It's possible to arrange further sessions for parents, governors, with PCSOs, health & safety officers, community safety officers. This has been done, perhaps it needs to be done once again. It has to be stressed that we do in certain areas have safe routes to schools, safe walking routes. Why aren't our children taking these routes? Why aren't they being encouraged, and parents can perhaps walk with them to school instead of blocking up all the roads

around the school. But those that insist on parking dangerously will have to be dealt with, and Hazel has given her suggestions.

All that I will say is that it is a real problem that concerns us all and we certainly don't wish to see a serious accident of the one you suggest might well happen, and so parents and those caring for children simply must listen and we have to ensure that our children are safe when they arrive at school.

Councillor Cundy asked the following supplementary question:-

Can we have an advertising campaign to highlight this issue more than it is at the moment?

Response by Councillor Hazel Evans, Executive Board Member for Environment:-

Yes, thank you it is something we will look into but hopefully the enforcement powers will fixed cameras will have a far greater effect, unfortunately when it hits somebody's pocket that seems to be when it has an affect.

8.3. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR LIAM BOWEN TO COUNCILLOR GLYNOG DAVIES, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR EDUCATION & CHILDREN

The Chair advised that Councillor Liam Bowen had submitted an apology for the meeting and had requested that a written answer be given.

8.4. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR ROB JAMES TO COUNCILLOR EMLYN DOLE, LEADER OF THE COUNCIL

"Local residents and sport teams are concerned with the recent announcement that the agreed asset transfer of Penygaer playing fields has been put on hold, pending the result of the public inquiry into the village green application for Llanerch Playing Fields. Would the Leader please outline what legal advice has been obtained by Carmarthenshire Council to suggest that the transfer of the asset should be paused?

Response by Councillor Emlyn Dole, Leader of the Council:-

Thank you for the question Councillor James but it does put me in a a bit of a difficult position because ordinarily I wouldn't expect detailed legal advice to be shared in a public forum, it could be inappropriate even prejudicial to do that, it is usually given in a closed session, but in aso far as your question attributes the deferral of the asset transfer to the village green application and the village green application alone, my understanding is that this is incorrect in that that is just one of the issues concerned.

My understanding is that there are a lot of unknowns at the moment including for instance, there could be objections to the planning application, that there could be a Judicial review, that the Education department still don't know what part and how much of the Penygaer Field would be required to provide facilities for both schools, for Dewi Sant and for Penygaer School as well, should Dewi Sant

eventually be built on Llanerch. It is against this whole background that the in-house lawyers have advised against transferring any interest in the land at this stage and keeping as much control of the land as possible, until such time as all the issues have been resolved.

8.18. QUESTION BY COUNCILLOR KEN LLOYD TO COUNCILLOR JANE TREMLETT, EXECUTIVE BOARD MEMBER FOR SOCIAL CARE & HEALTH

“Could the Executive Board Member assure me that the Social Care Workforce is effectively supported to ensure the care we deliver to our most vulnerable people is maintained to the highest standard.”

Response by Councillor Jane Tremlett, Executive Board Member for Social Care and Health:-

Thank you for the question Councillor Lloyd. Recruiting and retaining this workforce across the public and private sector is a challenge across Wales. These are the people who care for the most vulnerable people in our communities and who are committed to ensuring people are treated with dignity and respect to people who live in residential care or in their own homes. As you know, it is a high priority for me and the department to ensure the workforce of domiciliary and residential workers are supported and rewarded to do roles that, whilst rewarding are also demanding and stressful. We have over 2000 staff engaged in direct care work across Carmarthenshire covering the care home, domiciliary and third sectors, meaning it is of great strategic importance to the Authority to both support, and understand the issues facing, the social care workforce.

I can assure you that the commissioning of services by my department places great importance with our care providers on the provision of reliable and highly skilled staff. It is fundamental to high quality services that we recruit and retain quality staff and every effort is made to this effect when working with our care providers throughout the county.

Two years ago we launched a new framework for domiciliary care. Key features of this framework are setting reasonable pay rates and paying travel time for carers between roles. Importantly we have allowed care to be delivered flexibly through the week for people with agencies now empowered to provide care more responsively as clients need it. This takes out any operational benefit for agencies to cut visits short. Nationally the CSSIW have cited our approach to commissioning as ‘visionary’. However, whilst we have worked hard to improve the overall position, there is still much to do.

Pay levels have risen in the sector and the private sector has now largely caught up with council run services. However, despite contracting at amongst the highest hourly rate in Wales, recruitment remains a challenge with pay rates in other less demanding sectors, such as retail, now frequently matching the rates for care work. Establishing a better career structure for those in care work is an essential

part of the plan going forward. We need school leavers to see the work as part of a wider career plan where they have access to training and development in an industry that is expanding rapidly.

I welcome the idea of a task and finish group to look, on a cross party basis at this issue and develop recommendations to support the workforce we have and to enable my department to work in partnership with the care sector to meet the needs and expectations of our vulnerable citizens.

In conclusion, I would like to thank all our care staff who ensured care was delivered to our residents during the recent bad weather. This, of course, evidences the professionalism and commitment of our workforce to the vulnerable people we serve.

9. TO CONSIDER THE FOLLOWING NOTICES OF MOTION:-

9.1. NOTICE OF MOTION SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR GLYNOG DAVIES

Council considered the following Notice of Motion submitted by Councillor Glynog Davies:-

As the Lead Member for the Children's and Youth Services and my role as Youth Ambassador, I propose this Notice of Motion on behalf of the County's Youth Council. The members unanimously seek the support of Council with their campaign to see the voting age reduced from 18 years of age to 16, for all elections."

The Motion was duly seconded.

The proposer and seconder of the Motion were afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof and the proposer proceeded to outline the reasons for its submission, as set out in the Motion.

A number of statements were made both in support of, and against the Motion

The following Amendment to the Motion was proposed by Councillor Rob James and duly seconded:-

"The members of the County's Youth Council unanimously seek the support of the Council with their campaign to see the voting age reduced from 18 years of age to 16, for all elections.

Carmarthenshire Council supports the Youth Council's views on this matter and welcomes the Welsh Government's consultation on the lowering of the voting age for local government elections, launched earlier this year.

We pledge to write to the new Cabinet Secretary for Local Government and Public Services, Alun Davies AM, to state our support for the lowering of the voting age to 16 and the retention of First Past the Post voting method for local government elections."

The proposer and seconder of the Amendment were afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof and outlined the reasons for its submission.

A number of statements were made both in support of and against the Amendment and the Motion

Following a vote, it was

RESOLVED that the Amendment to the Motion be not supported.

Council thereupon proceeded to vote on the substantive Motion and it was

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Substantive Notice of Motion be adopted.

9.2. NOTICE OF MOTION SUBMITTED BY COUNCILLOR ANDRE MCPHERSON

Council considered the following Notice of Motion submitted by Councillor Andre McPherson:-

“I ask this Council to ratify my motion that for the month of February each year, LGBTQ History month, we fly the LGBTQ Rainbow Flag over the County Council buildings to show support for the diversity in our community.”

The motion was duly seconded

The proposer and seconder of the Motion were afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof and outlined the reasons for its submission, as set out in the Motion.

The following Amendment to the Motion was proposed by Councillor Emlyn Dole and duly seconded:-

“This council celebrates and supports the LGBTQ diversity in our community, but as flying any banner for a month is contrary to present policy, instructs the cross-party CRWG to review the council's Flag Flying Criteria, which would enable such requests to be legitimately considered.”

The proposer of the Amendment was afforded the opportunity of speaking in support thereof and outlined the reasons for its submission.

The proposer of the Motion (supported by his seconder), advised that he was happy to accept the amendment and was afforded the opportunity of speaking in support of the original motion and amendment.

A number of statements were made in support of the Motion, as amended, following which it became the Substantive Motion and the Council,

RESOLVED that the Substantive motion be adopted.

10. APPOINTMENT OF NEW MEMBERS OF THE STANDARDS COMMITTEE.

The Council considered a report on the appointment of new members to the Authority's Standards Committee.

In accordance with Council procedures and regulations, an appointments panel was convened to consider applications for two Independent Member vacancies and one Town and Community Council representative.

Council was informed that 10 applications were received for the two Independent Member vacancies and 10 nominations put forward from Town & Community Councils for the position of Community Member.

Following an interview process, the Panel recommended that Mrs Daphne Evans and Mrs Julie James be appointed as Independent Members for a 6 year term and that Town Councillor Phillip Rogers of St Clears Town Council be appointed as the Community Member until the end of his current term of office as Community Councillor.

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that

- 1. Mrs Daphne Evans and Mrs Julie James be appointed as Independent Members of the Authority's Standards Committee for a 6 year term.**
- 2. Town Councillor Phillip Rogers of St Clears Town Council be appointed as the Community Member until the end of his current term of office as Town/Community Councillor.**

11. TO CONSIDER THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE EXECUTIVE BOARD IN RESPECT OF THE FOLLOWING ITEM:-

**11.1. TREASURY MANAGEMENT AND PRUDENTIAL INDICATOR REPORT
01/04/17 TO 30/09/17.**

Council was informed that the Executive Board, at its meeting held on the 27th November, 2017, had, in accordance with the 2017/18 Treasury Management Policy and Strategy (adopted by Council on the 6th February 2017 – Minute 9 refers), approved an update on the treasury management activities from the 1st April 2017 to the 30th September 2017.

RESOLVED that the following recommendation of the Executive Board be adopted

'that the report be received'.

12. EXECUTIVE BOARD - 27TH NOVEMBER 2017.

Reference was made to Minute 6 and a discussion was held regarding the process for appointing members to the Board of Directors and the number of Directors to be appointed. Council was reminded that skills and experience, not political balance, were the most important considerations when appointing Directors to the Board, and the Directors would need also to meet the requirements of the

Companies Act. All 74 Councillors would be able to apply to sit as the Council's representative on the Board and the Executive Board would consider the appropriate appointments process.

RESOLVED that the report of the above meeting be received.

13. MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES

UNANIMOUSLY RESOLVED that the following amendment to committee membership be approved in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 2(2)(n):-

Councillor Dorian Phillips to replace Councillor Liam Bowen as a Plaid Cymru representative on the Planning Committee.

CHAIR

DATE